

## Benefits of Electric Power Competition

New Hampshire Energy Planning Advisory Board Stakeholder Forum

June 23, 2006

## Overview of Topics

- Who is NECA?
- Position on Electric Competition
- Factors Driving Electricity Costs in New England
- Benefits of Electric Competition
  - Studies
  - Transfer of Risk
  - Reliability Issues
  - Environmental Issues
- Recommendations



### Northeast Energy & Commerce Association

# NECA is New England's largest non-profit competitive power trade association.

- Founded in 1985
- 300 members including gas and electric utilities, power marketers, industrial users, electric generators, project developers, fuel and equipment suppliers, & service providers to industry such as law firms, investment bankers, environmental engineering & economic consulting firms
- 30-member Board of Directors
- Dual mission
  - Facilitate an open forum among all electric power stakeholders to foster development & maturation of competitive power markets
  - Promote reliable, environmentally responsible & cost-effective regional power supply



### **NECA's Position**

Electric competition is delivering benefits and should continue.

- NECA was an advocate and supporter of moving toward competitive power markets in the mid to late 1990s
- NECA believes that competition has delivered real tangible benefits to the New England region
- Despite some bumps in the road, NECA believes New England should stay the competitive course



### What About High Electric Costs?

A host of factors – unrelated to electric restructuring – have contributed to current high electricity prices.

**Natural Resources** 

Lack of indigenous natural resources makes us particularly vulnerable to fuel prices.

+ Resource Mix

Retirement of units (e.g., nuclear) & new natural gas plants have made region highly dependent on natural gas

+ Location

Region's location at end of natural gas pipelines makes it more expensive to get natural gas to the region.

+ Hurricanes

Last summer's Gulf Coast hurricanes threatened the reliability of our natural gas supply this winter

+ Environmental Standards

High environmental expectations have led to progressive regulation (i.e., fuel switching restrictions, permitting, siting)

**New England Electricity Costs** 



## Benefits of Competition

Recent studies highlight benefits of electric competition for consumers

#### CERA Study (6/05)

- Majority of U.S. consumers have paid less for electricity since onset of power system deregulation, with cost savings of \$34 Billion
- Average U.S. real price of power declined over era of deregulation from 1997-2004

Real power prices are lower – compared to previous regulated period & what prices would have been if traditional regulation continued

#### **AIM Foundation Study (12/05)**

- 1997 Restructuring Act has led to significant economic benefits for all customer classes & greater environmental protection
- Accrued Massachusetts customer savings of more than \$2 Billion
- 40% decrease in power plant emissions even with 20% production increases
- Competitive, reliable wholesale markets

AlM's report concluded that the Massachusetts Restructuring Act is working, but remains a work in progress.

## Benefits of Competition

Recent studies highlight benefits of electric competition for consumers

#### **Global Energy Decisions (7/05)**

- Wholesale competition has led to lower wholesale costs & more renewable resource options
- Consumers realized \$15.1 Billion in value during 1999-2003
- Dramatic improvement of power plant operational efficiency
- \$85.4 Million in production costs savings for PJM wholesale power customers

GED's analysis of Eastern Interconnection concluded that wholesale competition is working

#### New York PSC (3/06)

- Total real (inflation-adjusted)
  electric price for a typical
  residential retail customers in NY
  dropped by average of 16%
  between 1996 & 2004
- New generation construction in load pocket areas
- Increased generator availability
- Preserved safety & reliability of power system

Evaluation of New York's wholesale market found that wholesale competition led to significant efficiencies

## Benefits of Competition

Recent studies highlight benefits of electric competition for consumers

#### ISO-NE Whitepaper (4/05)

- Wholesale market cost reductions of \$700 Million annually
- Electric prices (after adjusting for fuel costs) declined by 5.7% since 1997
- \$9 Billion in power plant investment from 2001-2004
  - 10,000 MW of efficient new capacity
- Environmental improvements with reduction of CO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and SO<sub>2</sub> emissions

#### ISO/RTO Council (11/05)

- Regional operators such as ISO-NE
  - Maintain & improve grid reliability
  - Improve operational efficiencies
  - Operate markets that lower customer energy costs
  - Provide fair, independent & open markets, & transmission access
  - Provide effective regional planning

ISO-NE's evaluation of New England wholesale market found a host of regional benefits from electric competition

ISO/RTO Council's report highlights the value of independent regional operators such as ISO-NE

## What Does Competition Do?

One of the prime benefits of competition is the transfer of risks from consumers to the market.

#### **Cost-of-Service Model**

- Ratepayers finance new investments
- Rate recovery of bad investments
- Environmental & other upgrades recovered through rate base

#### **Deregulated Model**

- Shareholder financing
- Bad investments recovered from shareholders, not the ratepayers
- Environmental & other plant upgrades recovered from the market

Since 1999 (beginning of competition):

- CWIP costs = \$0
- New stranded costs = \$0
- Substantial power plant efficiency gains



## Regional Reliability is Improving

Existing generation has become more efficient, new generation has been built & new market signals to incent more generation.

- Existing Generation has become more reliable
  - Increased availability from 81% to 88%
- New Resources are available
  - Approximately 10,000 MW of new generation in New England since 2000
  - New demand side resource programs have been developed
- Stronger market signals for additional resources
  - Locational forward reserve market (incent resources in constrained areas)
  - Forward capacity auction
  - Increased demand response programs



### **Environmental Enhancements**

New England's competitive wholesale market has supported real environmental benefits to the region.

#### **RPS/REC Trading**

- Regional renewable energy credit (REC) trading system
- 5 of 6 New England states have a Renewable Portfolio Standard
- REC proceeds create incentive for renewable generation development

#### **Resource Decisions**

- New gas-fired generation has displaced older, less environmentally friendly resources
- Market enhancements will allow demand resources to participate in real-time energy & reserve markets

#### **Plant Performance**

- Increased power plant efficiency
- Decrease in emissions
  - NO<sub>x</sub> by 32%, SO<sub>2</sub> by 48% and CO<sub>2</sub> by 6%



### **NECA** Recommendations

A host of regional economic, environmental & reliability benefits have been realized through competitive electric markets, thus region should "stay the course."

- Stay the course do not give up on competitive electric markets
- Focus on developing new & diverse generation resources
- Address the region's NIMBY issues
- Complete regional transmission upgrades
- Include innovative demand side management, energy efficiency & conservation as part of approach





# Appendix Material

### Citations for Competition Studies

- CERA: Beyond the Crossroads: Future Direction of Power Industry Restructuring (June 2005)
- The AIM Foundation: *Electric Industry Restructuring in Massachusetts: Progress in Achieving the Goals of the Restructuring Act* (December 2005)
- Global Energy Decisions: The Benefits of Competition in America's Electric Grid: Cost Savings & Operating Efficiencies (July 2005)
- New York State DPS: Staff Report on the State of Competitive Energy Markets: Progress to Date & Future Opportunities (March 2006)
- ISO/RTO Council: *The Value of Independent Regional Grid Operators* (November 2005)
- ISO-NE: *The Benefits of ISOs and RTOs* (April 2005)

